UNFINISHED BUSINESS

What We (Still) Don’t Know About the Impacts of Small Business Finance

CGAP Presenters
Sai Krishna Kumaraswamy and Alexander Sotiriou

Panelists
Robert Cull, World Bank
Claudio Gonzalez-Vega, Ohio State University
Mayada El-Zoghbi, CFI
Timothy Ogden, FAI

May 20, 2021
CGAP Moderators

Sai Krishna Kumaraswamy
Financial Sector Analyst

Alexander Sotiriou
Senior Financial Sector Specialist
Panelists

Robert Cull
Research Manager & Lead Economist
(Finance and Private Sector Team)
Development Economics Group,
World Bank

Claudio Gonzalez-Vega
Professor Emeritus
Ohio State University
Board of Trustees
BBVA Microfinance Foundation

Mayada EL-Zoghbi
Managing Director
Center for Financial Inclusion

Timothy Ogden
Managing Director
Financial Access Initiative
NYU Wagner
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Session</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>~25 Mins</td>
<td>Webinar Overview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Livelihoods and MSE Finance in the Digital Age</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Key Insights &amp; Knowledge Gaps from Literature Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>~50 Mins</td>
<td>Opening Remarks by Panelists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Moderated Discussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>~15 Mins</td>
<td>Open Q&amp;A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CGAP’s Work:
Livelihoods and MSE Finance in the Digital Age
Micro and small enterprises provide a critical pathway to improved livelihoods for low-income households

*MSEs with 5 - 19 employees contribute to nearly half of all job creation in developing countries*

500m MSEs Globally

Dalberg (2019)

Note: Ayyagari et al (2014) use World Bank Enterprise Survey data which excludes firms < 5 employees
Financial services are critical to the success of small firms, yet there remains a $4.9 trillion financing gap.

Estimated Global Micro and Small Enterprise Credit Gap

USD trillions

Source: Dalberg, 2019, “Bridging the credit gap for micro and small enterprises through digitally enabled financing models”
The Digital MSE Finance Opportunity

*Digital technologies present new opportunities to address the dearth of effective financial services for underserved and excluded small firms. But several knowledge gaps remain that prevent these technologies from reaching their full potential.*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opportunity</th>
<th>What we don’t know</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fintech business models show promise in overcoming traditional barriers (OPEX + Risk) to serving excluded MSEs</td>
<td>Which fintechs are best positioned to reach underserved MSEs and what support is needed for them to do so</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MFIs, the original MSE finance innovators, are increasingly leveraging new technologies to serve excluded MSEs</td>
<td>Best practices for pragmatic, cost effective approaches to digitization that result in measurable value for customers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Small firms are adopting digital technologies in ways that address financial and non-financial challenges and may facilitate improved access to finance</td>
<td>If/how technology meets the holistic needs of MSEs and If/how financial services supports livelihoods</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*By addressing these knowledge gaps, CGAP seeks to accelerate the pace at which digitally enabled financial services reach excluded and underserved MSEs in a way that supports the livelihoods of their owners and employees.*
Literature Review

Key Insights and Knowledge Gaps
Most MSEs are created out of necessity, and remain small throughout their lifetime

✓ Unable to find wage employment
✓ Sustain and smooth incomes until they find wage jobs/ off-season in agriculture
✓ Cope with health shocks
✓ Finance agricultural activities

They face several interconnected, binding constraints that inhibit their productivity, profitability and expansion

✓ Access to finance
✓ Skilled labor
✓ Advisory services
✓ Growth mindset
✓ Utilities related
✓ Crimes, economic shocks

A narrative for access to finance for MSEs

The historical narrative centered on the group lending model of microcredit, and envisioned an escape from poverty through microenterprise.

A narrative for access to finance for MSEs

However, practitioner experience and research suggests that this narrative isn’t true for most MSEs.

Consequently, there was No Escape from Poverty.
Here’s what we learned about the impacts of MSE finance

*Insights from a literature review*
Microcredit has modest impacts on the average borrower

It helps:

• Expand scale of business operations (both revenues and expenses, hours worked)
• Increase investment in consumer durables (motorcycles, phones, TVs, fridges, rickshaws etc.)
• Keeps business going instead of shutting down or from becoming unemployed

However, microcredit does not meaningfully increase enterprise profits, household consumption, promote entry into new businesses or fuel an escape from poverty

Impacts of microcredit are greater for borrowers with previous experience of running a business.

‘Strivers’ or ‘Gung-Ho Entrepreneurs’ are borrowers with ex-ante entrepreneurial mindset, who have:

- Large target business size
- Growth goals
- Extensive social networks and use of informal credit facilities from other households
- Making full use of credit facilities when extended

Photo Credit: Rana Pandey, CGAP Photo Contest, 2016

Sources: Banerjee et al (2017)
Microcredit helps women expand or take up new enterprises

*But it does not improve their enterprise outcomes like sales or profits.*

Some of this is explained by:

- Women’s self-selection into low growth potential sectors like small scale retail, high contact services, caregiving etc.
- Women diverting their loans to fund the enterprises of the men in their household, or for household consumption
- Women’s bargaining power within households
- Restrictive social norms around women’s access to and control over economic resources

Much of the gender gap in enterprise profitability remains unexplained.

Flexibility in loan characteristics has shown to improve impacts from financing

The following, have had greater impacts on enterprise profits, and encourage otherwise risk-averse borrowers to start enterprises:

- Larger sized loans
- Individual liability loans
- Repayment holidays
- Flexible repayment schedules
- Digital channels of delivery (especially for women borrowers)

What we have learned so far about the impact of MSE finance rests squarely on microcredit.
What is the geographic footprint of impact evidence?

- Bosnia & Herzegovina
- Ethiopia
- Ghana
- India
- Kenya
- Madagascar
- Malawi
- Mexico
- Mongolia
- Morocco
- Pakistan
- Philippines
- South Africa
- Sri Lanka
- Tanzania
- Thailand
- Uganda
- Vietnam
- Zambia
- Zimbabwe
The MSE finance impact narrative is incomplete, and there are several knowledge gaps.
What are the implications for the microfinance community?

Do we need an updated narrative?
- An improved Theory of Change
- Identify broad and comprehensive pathways of impact
- Redefine ‘impact’ to accommodate more modest, but meaningful goals

Do we need more evidence?
- Looking beyond RCTs, employing varied research methods
- Asking broader questions, aligning impacts of MSE finance with livelihoods
Panelists

**Robert Cull**  
Research Manager & Lead Economist  
(Finance and Private Sector Team)  
Development Economics Group,  
World Bank

**Claudio Gonzalez-Vega**  
Professor Emeritus  
Ohio State University  
Board of Trustees  
BBVA Microfinance Foundation

**Mayada EL-Zoghbi**  
Managing Director  
Center for Financial Inclusion

**Timothy Ogden**  
Managing Director  
Financial Access Initiative  
NYU Wagner
Panelists’ Opening Remarks
Moderated Discussion
Questions and comments from the audience

Zoom Q&A
Pose questions directly to the panelists and presenters.

- Please indicate if your question is intended for a specific person.
- Feel free to share your name, country and organization (but it’s not mandatory)

Zoom Chat
Share your own views and experiences, or reactions on today’s discussion.

- Does this resonate with you? What are your thoughts on these evidence gaps? Is there research or literature we may have missed?
- Can you think of novel ways to define and document ‘impact’ of MSE Finance?
Thank you

To learn more, please visit

www.cgap.org